IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF MISSISSIPPI No. 2012-IA-00166-SCT

CHARLES HOOKER, DAVID GATLIN NATHAN KERN AND ANTHONY MCCRAY Appellants-Defendants

v.

JIM HOOD, ATTORNEY GENERAL FOR THE STAT OF MISSISSIPPI, EX REL. THE STATE OF MISSISSIPPI Appellee-Plaintiff

BRIEF OF APPELLANT AARON BROWN

INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL FROM THE CIRCUIT COURT OF HINDS COUNTY, MISSISSIPPI, FIRST JUDICIAL DISTRICT HONORABLE TOMMIE GREEN, SENIOR CIRCUIT JUDGE, PRESIDING

Edward Blackmon, Jr., MSB
BLACKMON & BLACKMON, PLLC
907 West Peace Street
Post Office Drawer 105
Canton, Mississippi 39046
Telephone: 601-859-1567
Facsimile: 601-859-2311

edblackmon@blackmonlawfirm.com

ATTORNEY FOR APPELLANT AARON BROWN

CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PERSONS

The undersigned counsel of record certifies that the following listed persons have an interest in the outcome of this case. These representations are made in order that the Justices of the Supreme Court of Mississippi may evaluate possible disqualification or recusal.

- 1. Honorable Tomie T. Green, Senior Circuit Judge, Seventh District Circuit Court of Hinds County, Mississippi.
- 2. State of Mississippi, Appellee/Plaintiff.
- 3. Hon. Jim Hood, Attorney General for the State of Mississippi, ex rel. the State of Mississippi, Appellee/Plaintiff.
- 4. Hon. Jim Hood, counsel for Attorney General for the State of Mississippi, ex rel. the State of Mississippi, Appellee/Plaintiff.
- 5. Hon. Bridgette Wiggins, Special Assistant Attorney General, counsel for Attorney General for the State of Mississippi, ex rel. the State of Mississippi, Appellee/Plaintiff.
- 6. Hon. Christopher Epps, Commissioner of Mississippi Department of Corrections, Appellee/Defendant.
- 7. David K. Scott, Special Assistant Attorney General, counsel for Hon. Christopher Epps, Commissioner of Mississippi Department of Corrections, Appellee/Defendant.
- 8. Charles Hooker, Appellant/Defendant.
- 9. David Gatlin, Appellant/Defendant.
- 10. Nathan Kern, Appellant/Defendant.
- 11. Anthony McCray, Appellant/Defendant.
- 12. Thomas M. Fortner, ERIK M. LOWERY, P.A., counsel for Charles Hooker, David Gatlin, Nathan Kern and Anthony McCray, Appellants/Defendants.
- 13. Erik M. Lowrey, ERIK M. LOWERY, P.A., counsel for Charles Hooker, David Gatlin, Nathan Kern and Anthony McCray, Appellants/Defendants.
- 14. Richard A. Filce, ERIK M. LOWERY, P.A., counsel for Charles Hooker, David Gatlin, Nathan Kern and Anthony McCray, Appellants/Defendants.
- 15. Kirby Tate, Appellant/Defendant.

- 16. Sylvia S. Owen, counsel for Kirby Tate, Appellant/Defendant.
- 17. Katherine Robertson, Appellant/Defendant.
- 18. Luther T. Munford, PHELPS DUNBAR, LLP, counsel for Katherine Robertson, Appellant/Defendant.
- 19. Robert Gregg Mayer, PHELPS DUNBAR, LLP, counsel for Katherine Robertson, Appellant/Defenant
- 20. John M. Colette, .101-IN M. COLLETTE & ASSOCIATES, counsel for Katherine Robertson, Appellant/Defendant.
- 21. Charles W. Pickering, Sr., CHARLES W. PICKERING SR. LAW OFFICE, counsel for Katherine Robertson, Appellant/Defendant.
- 22. Azikiwe Kambule, Appellant/Defendant.
- 23. Joshua Howard, Appellant/Defendant.
- 24. Cynthia A. Stewart, CYNTHIA A. STEWART, P.A., counsel for Azikiwe Kambule and Joshua Howard, Appellants/Defendants.
- 25. Aafram Sellers, counsel for Appellant/Defendant Joshua Howard.
- 26. Edward Blackmon Jr., BLACKMON & BLACKMON, PLLC, counsel for Azikiwe Kambule, Appellants/Defendants.
- 27. Emily Rebecca Hentz, Putative Intervenor.
- 28. Alison Oliver Kelly, counsel for Emily Rebecca Hentz, Putative Intevenor.
- 29. Haley Barbour, in His Capacity as Governor of the State of Mississippi at the Time of the Events Alleged in this Suit, Amicus Curiae in the Circuit Court ("Former Governor Haley Barbour, Amicus Curiae").
- 30. Charles E. Griffin, BUTLER, SNOW, O'MARA, STEVENS & CANNADA, PLLC, counsel for Former Governor Haley Barbour, Amicus Curiae.
- 31. E. Barney Robinson III, BUTLER, SNOW, O'MARA, STEVENS & CANNADA, PLLC, counsel for Former Governor Haley Barbour, Amicus Curiae.
- 32. Benjamin M. Watson, BUTLER, SNOW, O'MARA, STEVENS & CANNADA, PLLC, counsel for Former Governor Haley Barbour, Amicus Curiae.

- 33. Melissa Baltz, BUTLER, SNOW, O'MARA, STEVENS & CANNADA, PLLC, counsel for Former Governor Haley Barbour, Amicus Curiae.
- 34. Hon. Phil Bryant, in his official capacity as Governor of the State of Mississippi.
- 35. Hon. Robert G. Waites, counsel for Hon. Phil Bryant, in his official capacity as Governor of the State of Mississippi.
- 36. Hon. Jack L. Wilson, counsel for Hon. Phil Bryant, in his official capacity as Governor of the State of Mississippi.

APPELIANT AARON BROWN

Edward Blackmon, Jr., MSB #3354

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases	State v. Metts, 88 So.525, 530 (Miss. 1921); p. 10
Statutes and Rules	Section 124 Mississippi Constitution; p. 7, 9, 11
	Mississippi Constitution of 1890 and VI §§ 144, 173

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PERSONS	2, 3, 4
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	5
TABLE OF CONTENTS	6
STATEMENT OF ISSUE	7
STATEMENT OF THE CASE	8,9
A. Statement of the Facts	
ARGUMENT	9, 10
CONCLUSION	11, 12
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE	13, 14, 15

STATEMENT OF ISSUE

Appellant, Aaron Brown, joins in the Statement of Issue, set out in the Brief of appellants, Charles Hooker, David Gatlin, Nathan Kern, and Anthony McCray. In addition, Appellant Brown, list the following additional Issue for consideration by the Court.

I. Whether Section 124 requires publication daily, weekly, or other, as a condition for pardon?

STATEMENT OF THE CASE

Appellant Aaron Brown, joins in the statement and adopts the record excerpts of the case set out in the Brief of Appellants, Charles Hooker, David Gatlin, Nathan Kern, and Anthony McCray. In addition, he sets out the following specifics to his case.

A. Statement of Facts

Appellant Aaron Brown is a felon convicted under the laws of the State of Mississippi of Murder, concealed weapon and possession of control substance in Hinds County, Mississippi on December 12, 1990.

Appellant Aaron Brown was issued a Pardon by former Governor Haley Barbour on or before January 10, 2012. Prior to Appellant Brown being released pursuant to Governor Barbour's Pardon, State Attorney General Jim Hood filed suit in the First Judicial District of Hinds County Circuit Court seeking to nullify the Pardons of approximately 200 former state felons, including, Appellant Brown.

Attorney General Hood sought and obtained a hearing without notice to Appellant Brown before the Honorable Judge Tomie Green, Circuit Court Judge, Hinds County, Mississippi on his Petition for a Temporary Restraining Order. An Order was entered on January 11, 2012 by Judge Green granting the relief sought in the Petition for Temporary Restraining Order. (C.P. 43, R.E. 11).

Attorney General Hood followed the January 11, 2012 Order by filing a First Amended Verified Complaint (C.P. 63, R.E. 52), in which he for the first time, named Appellant Aaron Brown as a party defendant.

Appellant Brown filed a Special Appearance for Purposes of Motion to Dismiss. (C.P.)

The matter was set by Judge Green for hearing on January 23, 2012. Judge Green after hearing

from the attorneys for the respective parties, entered an Order extending the Temporary Restraining Order for an additional 11 days.

The Court entered an Order on January 26, 2012 extending the TRO. (C.P. 540 R.E. 28)

Appellant Brown on January 31, 2012, filed his Answer and Defenses to the Second

Amended Complaint. Thereafter, on February 1, 2012 Appellant Brown filed for Writ of

Prohibition and/or Mandamus and Emergency Stay.

This Court by Order dated February 2012, stayed the proceedings in the trial court, and set times for briefing and argument before the Court.

SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT

Appellant, Aaron Brown, joins in the Summary of the Argument set out in the Brief of appellants, Charles Hooker, David Gatlin, Nathan Kern, and Anthony McCray.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Appellant, Aaron Brown, joins in the Standard of Review set out in the Brief of appellants, Charles Hooker, David Gatlin, Nathan Kern, and Anthony McCray.

ARGUMENT

Appellant, Aaron Brown, joins in the Argument set out in the Brief of appellants, Charles Hooker, David Gatlin, Nathan Kern, and Anthony McCray. In addition, Appellant Aaron Brown submits the following additional Argument to be considered by the Court.

Section 124 of the Mississippi Constitution grants the authority to pardon in the Governor of the State of Mississippi. This power is vested solely in the Governor, in the executive branch, and not to the Attorney General or the Courts, both of which are part of the judicial branch of government. Miss. Const. of 1890 and VI §§144, 173.

Under our Constitution, the Governor has the power to grant a pardon for any reason, or no reason. Judge Etheridge, as early as 1921, spoke to the clear constitutional authority vested in the governor in his dissenting opinion in *State v. Metts*, 88 So. 525, 530 (Miss. 1921). Justice Etheridge with scholarly insight, stated that the "decision as to whether the publication was made is not subject to judicial review". This view on the separation of power has held steadfast in numerous opinions by his Court.

Appellant Brown, published his Notice of application for Pardon on September 29, 2011, October 6, 2011, October 13, 2011 and October 20, 2011 in the Clarion Ledger newspaper. (C.P. 492) The first publication was one hundred and two (102) days prior to the pardon granted to Appellant Brown, and the last publication was seventy (70) days prior to Appellant's pardon.

Section 124, provides in part that:

... [i]n cases of a felony, after conviction no pardon shall be granted until the applicant thereof shall have published for thirty days, in some newspaper in said county, then in an adjoining county, his petition or pardon, setting forth therein the reasons why such pardon shall be granted.

This Court should take judicial notice that in 1890, as it is in 2012, most counties in the State of Mississippi did not have daily newspapers. Some did not have weekly newspapers. Given this irrefutable fact, the framers of our Constitution could not have intended that there be thirty consecutive publications, or that the publication be made over the course of a thirty-week period. The interpretation now being advanced by the Attorney General requires a construction of Section 124 that has no logical application to the era of its enactment, nor contemporarily.

Clearly, the publication provision of Section 124 is procedural only. The Section is silent as to whether its application is for consecutive days, weeks, or just a date of publication thirty (30) days prior to the granting of a pardon.

The likely-hood is that the framers of our Constitution were well aware of the publication limitations in the various counties of this State, and thereby took that into account in the enactment of this provision,

An equally vague and unexplained provision of this very same section of Section 124, is the requirement that publication set forth therein, "the reason why such pardon should be granted." What if there was no reasons given, or just one reason, could the pardon be challenged on this ground? Not likely. This provision too, is procedural. Only the Governor is left to consider and determine whether any such reason, reasons, or no reason are sufficient to warrant a pardon. Imagine, what if we were here arguing the constitutional sufficiency of the reasons given for requesting a pardon? Given the desired and requested reconstruction of Section 124, it is entirely plausible that this subject area is next up.

It was never intended under our Constitution that the judiciary would stand as filter or screen for governortial pardons. It's just the opposite, the pardon is the last and final word in the criminal justice process. The facts, law and circumstances of the crime, are not compelled by the doctrines of due process and stare decisis. To now declare that Appellant Brown's pardon is reviewable by the Court would mean that the judiciary could thrust itself into executive branch of government with the power to oversee all acts of pardon granted by the Governor. It would no longer be the exercise of "chief executive power" as contemplated under Section 124 of the Constitution. It would then be Chief Executive/Judiciary power.

CONCLUSION

The Court should resist the plea that it dismantled more than one hundred years of recognized and accepted separation of the powers of our three branches of government. The branches operate best when their functions remain separate as mandated by the Constitution.

The three branches of government have on occasion pushed and nudged each other, but never have one or the other been overtaken by a sister branch, as is threaten in the lower Court.

For reasons stated herein, as well as that which is set forth by the <u>Hooker</u> Appellants brief, the decision of the trial court should be reversed and rendered, ant dismissed at Appellees costs.

This the 7th day of February, 2012.

Respectfully submitted,

Edward Blackmon, Jr., MSB

OF COUNSEL:

BLACKMON & BLACKMON, PLLC 907 West Peace Street Post Office Drawer 105 Canton, Mississippi 39046 Telephone: 601-859-1567

Facsimile: 601-859-2311

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE AND FILING

I, Edward Blackmon, Jr., do hereby certify that I have caused on this day the delivery of instrument to the following, via hand delivery, First Class United States Mail, postage prepaid and/or e-mail:

Honorable Tomie T.
Green Circuit Court
Judge
First Judicial District
of Hinds County, Mississippi
Hinds County
Courthouse 407 East
Pascagoula Street
Jackson, MS 39201
fashley@co.hinds.ms.us

The Honorable Jim Hood
Special Assistant Bridgette Wiggins
Attorney General for the State of
Mississippi P.O. Box 220
Jackson, Mississippi 39201
jihood@ago.state.ms.us
bwill@ago.state.ms.us

Alison Oliver Kelly Alison Oliver Kelly, PLLC Attorney at Law P.O. Box 1644 Jackson, MS 39215 kellymd10@aol.com

David K. Scott
Mississippi Department of
Corrections 723 North President
Street
Jackson, MS 39201
dscott@mdoc.state.ms.us

Charles E. Griffin
E. Barney Robinson III
Benjamin M. Watson
Melissa Baltz
BUTLER, SNOW, O'MARA, STEVENS & CANNADA,
PLLC 200 Renaissance at Colony Park, Suite 1400

1020 Highland Colony Parkway (39157)
Post Office Box 6010
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010
charles.griffin@butlersnow.com
barney.robinson@butlersnow.com
ben.watson@butlersnow.com
melissa.baltz@butlersnow.com

Cynthia A. Stewart Cynthia A. Stewart, PA 118 Homestead Drive, Suite C Madison, MS 39110 cstewart@mississippitrial.com

Aafram Sellers 5760 1-55 North, Suite 300 Jackson, MS 39211 <u>aafram@sellerslawfirm.net</u>

Charles W. Pickering Sr. CHARLES W. PICKERING SR. LAW OFFICE P.O. Box 465 Petal, MS 39465-0465

John M. Collette
JOHN M. COLLETTE & ASSOCIATES
The Pinnacle at Jackson Place
190 East Capitol Street, Suite 475
Jackson, MS 39201
Post Office Box 861
Jackson, MS 39205
icole83161@aol.com

Luther T. Munford Robert Gregg Mayer PHELPS DUNBAR LLP 4270 1-55 North Jackson, Mississippi 39211 munfordl@phelps.com luther.munford@phelps.com

Sylvia S. Owen
Attorney at Law
P. 0. Box 7252
Tupelo, MS 38802
OwenLawFirm@comcast.net

Thomas M. Fortner Richard A. Filce ERIK M. LOWERY, P.A. 525 Corinne Street Hattiesburg, MS 39401 tom@eriklowreypa.com rfilce@hotmail.com

Robert G. Waites
Jack L. Wilson
Office of the Governor
P.O. Box 139
Jackson, MS 39205
bobby.waites@governor.ms.gov
jack.wilson@governor.ms.gov

This the 7th day of February, 2012.

Edward Blackmon, Jr.